REVIEWS

The Case Against Psychotherapy Registration: A Conservation Issue for the Human Potential Movement

Richard Mowbray
Trans Marginal Press, 1995, £12.95, 306pp

If you thought the burning issue of the accreditation and registration of psychotherapy practitioners had gone away since it was widely and vigorously debated in *Self & Society* in the early 90s, you'd be very mistaken, and Richard Mowbray's important and thought-provoking book should be essential reading for all current and would-be therapy practitioners.

He is very clear which side he is on — that of the grassroots, democratic, peer-reviewed, pragmatic, humanistic approach to quality control; and equally clear which he is not on — that of the vested-interest, closed-market, self-defining, impenetrable 'professionals'. Very occasionally he makes a slightly gratuitous sideswipe, but most of his fluent and excellently-documented argument is compelling and disturbing.

The first and by far the largest of the book's four parts looks at the history, purpose and problems of psychotherapy registration. It tells how early calls for regulation came from mainstream and decidedly partisan concern about 'mind-changing cults', and shows how — contrary to mythology — neither 'Europe'

nor the British government has ever exerted pressure to inaugurate or speed up the registration of psychotherapy. It looks at the meanings of and assumptions behind 'psychotherapy', 'registration', 'professionalisation' and 'licensing', citing numerous studies to show how professional registration almost invariably works against the interest of clients, without guaranteeing any noticeable improvement in the quality of service offered. It gives a useful potted history of the Rugby Conferences which provided the seeds for the United Kingdom Standing Committee on Psychotherapy (UKSCP, later UKCP), and explains very clearly the interests which lay behind that foundation.

While reporting fairly and accurately the professionals' own reasons for encouraging accreditation (where such answers were forthcoming), Richard Mowbray shows how muddled and unconvincing such 'reasons' often are. Not only does registration not guarantee the 'protection of the public'; there is not even any agreement about the nature of psychotherapy (UKCP apparently has yet to offer such a definition in its literature).

One of Mowbray's major sources is Daniel Hogan's exhaustive four-volume 1979 American study, *The Regulation of Psychotherapists*. One of the more memorable quotations from Hogan is that, while there have undoubtedly been some instances amongst the mass of anecdotal evidence of harmful unregulated therapy and groupwork, 'a similar array of horror stories could easily be assembled about highly credentialed psychiatrists and psychologists, all of them licensed'.

Also quoted at length is Roberta Russell's 1993 study, endorsed by the American Psychological Association, which looks at the factors which influence the effectiveness of psychotherapy. It concludes that academic qualifications, length of training, type of training, and the practitioner's having been in therapy, appear to have no influence at all on the effectiveness of the therapy offered by a particular practitioner. What really makes the difference is experience, empathy, the motivation of the client, and the quality of the alliance between client and practitioner. Thus the extension of training and insistence on academic qualifications, as stressed by UKCP, BAC and other psychotherapy 'professionals', are highly unlikely to produce any improvement in the quality of therapeutic help being offered. Indeed, as they close therapy training to all but those able to afford the ever-growing fees (with the knock-on effect of higher client fees), therapy will become increasingly elitist, far from the vision of the founders of humanistic psychotherapy and the human potential movement.

This brings us on to part two of the book, which demonstrates alarmingly how practitioners other than 'real therapists' (and, at a pinch, 'real counsellors') are being edged out of the picture, effectively sidelining the human potential movement. Richard Mowbray emphasises that much of the important work within psychotherapy has always been at the

fringe, and very effectively uses Reich's analysis of fascism to demonstrate how bureaucratisation can all too easily smother the seeds of creativity and individuality.

The book doesn't just analyse; it also offers some excellent alternative models. Part three examines practical issues around disclosure, complaints procedures and open registers. Richard Mowbray's proposal for 'non-credentialled registration' is both appealing, workable and humanistic: a right to practise under a title ('psychotherapist' or whatever), easy to acquire simply by applying, but with the proviso that it can be withdrawn on evidence of the practitioner doing harm — such evidence to be judged by a panel of practitioners, clients, government officials and the public.

The final part of the book is a series of appendices, reprinting articles and looking at the experience of registration in other countries, and the book concludes with a very good bibliography and index: it is good to see so many index references to *Self & Society*!

Richard Mowbray has done psychotherapy an enormous service in compiling such a readable and thought-provoking investigation into who we are and where we think we are going. I look forward with anticipation and barely-bated glee to the reaction that *The Case Against Psychotherapy Registration* elicits from those organisations and individuals that it questions the most sharply.

John Button

Questions and Answers on Counselling in Action

Windy Dryden (ed.)
Sage, 1993, £7.99, 170pp.

This sample of the Windy Dryden *oeuvre* derives from a simple and useful idea: in 1991 he invited experienced and trainee counsellors to submit questions that they would like answered by 'experts'. Some of the questions included here were addressed to and are answered by named individuals, but Windy Dryden selected most of the people contributing answers. In two cases the question is answered by two people, who provide contrasting viewpoints.

The result is a diverse book covering 30 questions and answers. Some of these relate to common aspects of practice (e.g. the ending phase of counselling, ethical issues, being in private practice), and some are specific either to counsellor/client relationship (such as issues of gender and ethnicity) or to counselling orientation.

It's the kind of book where any time you open it, you're likely to find something of current interest that relates to your practice and to issues you've been thinking about, but where there are also some items that don't grab your attention, at least on this occasion. It seems to me

that by its very nature the book's broadest appeal would be to counsellors in training and those at the beginning of their counselling career; it is unlikely to be read avidly from cover-to-cover by all readers.

The style of writing is variable, with some contributors taking a personal approach to their answer, some being very focused and practical, and others being more academic and quoting a range of views (and bibliographic references) on the issue.

One question that the collection raises for me is to do with the danger of seeking definitive answers. How will it help me if I take on board 'expert' opinions and/or personal experience? Is it pandering to my lack of confidence in myself? Or should I take what's said as representing good practice? It seems unfortunate to me that the remit has been interpreted inconsistently, without presentation of contrasting views throughout. I imagine that different practitioners would give quite different and equally acceptable responses to many of the questions.

If we regard the questions and answers as serving to stimulate thought and discussion —and I imagine that was Windy Dryden's intention — then the collection serves a useful purpose indeed.

Ruth Finer

In Search of the Holy Grail and the Precious Blood

Ean and Deike Begg
Harper Collins, 1994, £6.99

In a quest for factual and legendary evidence of one of the most powerful myths of the Western World these Jungian authors take us on a journey round Europe, linking places and objects to the origins of Christianity and ancient pagan rites. Similar versions of the grail myth emerged in the 12th and 13th centuries, linked to Arthurian legend, the Noble Order of the Knights Templar and the life and religious practices of the Cathars, whose blood line, some believe, goes back to Christ himself.

In its earliest written account, a poem by Chrétien de Troyes, the story of Parsifal and the wounded Fisher King has become a symbol of the quest of the male psyche towards consciousness and healing of the inner feminine. From the ruins of Dinas Bran in Wales to the enigma of Montségur in France and Castel del Monte in Italy the legend unfolds gaining power and meaning through the lives of those that were guardians and keepers of age-old secrets.

This book is a very thorough presentation of a vast and fascinating subject that to this day has produced more questions than answers. It has dozens of entries in 13 countries, with maps and occasional recommendations on where to stay or eat, and takes the reader through history and legend as well as the inner reality of the myth. As we encounter kings, rulers and the Church all playing ruthless power

games — a 'religious cleansing' involving torture, death and destruction — we witness a past that mirrors recent European history. As a pilgrimage could this help us own our shadow and allow the myth's energy to impress itself on the psyche, with a redemptive and cathartic effect?

Laura Ribbons

Psychoanalytic Therapy in the Hospital Setting

Paul Janssen
Routledge, 1994, £15.99, 229pp.

Paul Janssen is Chair of Psychosomatic Medicine and Psychotherapy at the University of Bochum, and Director of the Psychiatric Hospital of Dortmund. He has had more than thirty years experience of inpatient group psychotherapy, and has developed a model for working with patients suffering from a wide range of psychiatric and psychosomatic disorders.

The German Health Services have provided both the encouragement and the finance to enable Paul Janssen to develop this work, ironic when one considers that it was originally pioneered in Britain, where funding remains in short supply and emphasis is less on inpatient hospital treatment, more on 'integrating' people into the community.

This is our loss — Professor Janssen shows from his examples in clinical practice how the issues worked through in the group process, the transference and counter-transference, object relation patterns, confrontation and interpretation, splitting etc, enabled both the patients and the team of psychoanalysts, psychotherapists, nurses, art and music therapists, and have brought about an effective and lasting change.

He encourages a patient-centred approach, with emphasis on individual psychoanalytic therapy as 'a necessary complement to group dynamics', and the maintenance of this dyadic relationship (between patient and individual therapist) 'ensures constancy in the working alliance'.

I was very struck by how changes were effected, not just by the patients, but by the team of nurses, doctors and therapists, and how it was as much a learning process for the latter as it was for the people who were classed as ill!

Paul Janssen illustrates his model of working with clinical vignettes which bring the whole book alive and enable the reader to follow the process with ease. There are tables in the Appendix where the reader can see at a glance the type of patient treated, the method and duration of treatment, diagnosis and end result.

This is a valuable book, not only for those already working in health care but for anyone who is interested in group dynamics and the group process.

Sally Cunis

When Boundaries Betray Us

Carter Heyward
Harper San Francisco, 1994, £7.99, 254pp.

This book is divided into three sections — the first, an account of the author's 18 months of therapy, the mid-section charting her next four years healing (her word), and the last part containing short papers by sympathetic friends and colleagues. Heyward is a lesbian theologian/pastor who sought therapy at a time of burn-out in her work and one year into her recovery from alcohol dependence and bulimia. She describes the initial months of therapy as being mutually empowering to client and therapist, two lesbian healers discovering common ground in a patriarchal world.

However, several months in, when she broaches the subject of a future friendship and is denied it, the emphasis of the sessions shifts into a power struggle. Heyward demands friendship, in passionate poetry and prose (some included in the text), whilst her therapist seems alternately to offer hope and then snatch it away. Only in one short period does Heyward become the 'compliant client', when she remembers childhood abuse, episodes she later rejects as being any part of her own history.

From this experience, Heyward develops her critique against the therapeutic boundaries that prevented an equal relationship with her therapist, boundaries made in her opinion by patriarchy in order to compartmentalise, prevent mutuality and maintain power relations. She pre-empts her critics rather nicely by asserting that readers stuck in patriarchal mode will, naturally, pathologise her, something I admit I found hard not to do. Her insistence that the healing relationship was invalid if not totally two-way, that they concentrate on making connections between spirituality, poverty and racism rather than dealing with her own 'stuff', and that a friendship in the future outweighed in importance the work of there and then, all point to denial. No room is allowed for the hurt child inside the adult that turned to alcohol. And it is the very lack of firm and containing boundaries that seem to make this particular therapy experience so traumatic.

Having said that, there is a lot in the book that is thought-provoking, and the kind of questions Heyward brings up, of power relations and mutuality, need to be addressed by everyone in a helping profession. Therapy is often decontextualised from the social and political, and therapists who do not think deeply about racism and sexism and the part these play in their own and their clients' lives can be colluding in a normalising, rather than a liberating, process. Boundaries should never become barriers, will only be as strong and non-abusive as the therapist herself, and need regular re-examination.

Tash Fairbanks

Torn in Two: The Experience of Maternal Ambivalence

Rozsika Parker
Virago, 1995, £12.95

Writing as a psychoanalyst and drawing on the material of her patients as well as on interviews with mothers, Rozsika Parker pleads for more recognition of the commonality of maternal ambivalence towards children. She suggests that these conflicts are potentially creative, provided the mother is not pressurised by personal and cultural attitudes to feel inordinately *guilty*, shameful and even persecuted. Unfortunately, maternal ambivalence is often equated with aggression. Psychoanalysts have always tended to focus on the child, rather than on the mother's ambivalence; yet mothering, like all social roles, is deeply affected by the cultural, individual, private and emotional meanings of motherhood. Any group of women will usually produce an admission of hostile feelings, even murderous fantasies towards a crying baby or a rebellious child, and these confessions will be shared, if reluctantly. Yet the influence of the Madonna myth, of the all-loving, all-giving, tolerant and self-denying idealised mother, remains influential.

This is an important book at a time when an increasing proportion of women are both mothers and workers; when expectations of the ability to maintain both roles are prevalent; when single mothers tend to be blamed for the increasing numbers of disturbed and violent children. Yet every mother has to negotiate the conflicts between her expectations of shared joy and love, the inner and the external reality. She usually looks to other mothers for confirmation of whether her mothering is 'good' or 'bad', yet is perhaps more influenced still by her own experience of being mothered — the mother and child within, which have such a powerful influence. Love is easier to acknowledge than hate, yet all relationships carry an element of both.

Unfortunately popular writings on child care tend to idealise the 'perfect' parent and to denigrate those who admit to conflicting feelings towards their children. But these very conflicts can spur the mother to a deeper understanding and tolerance of ambivalence in herself and in her child.

This is a very rich book full of case material and interesting quotations from Bion, Winnicott, Freud, Klein and Balint, as well as recent research findings such as the writings of Dinora Pines, Joan Raphael Leff and J. Kristova. The 'patriarchal regulation of families' has held sway for too long; the feminists have had considerable influence on our attitudes towards women's roles in society, so it is encouraging that so many contemporary analysts and therapists are looking again at the conflicts inherent in mothering, different expectations and attitudes to boys and girls and how sadistic abuse of children comes about.

There are excellent notes with references for further reading.

Betty Gould

The Stresses of Counselling in Action

Windy Dryden (ed.)
Sage, 1994, £7.99

A paradox for counsellors and therapists is that despite the passion and fascination most of us bring to our work, we also acknowledge that in Freud's terms, it is 'an impossible profession'. *The stresses of Counselling in Action* covers a wide range of areas (from working with disability to the training and supervision of counsellors), where practitioners describe what is impossible about their specific work and setting. This book invoked recognition and sighs of relief as I realised that others too tussle with difficulties closely related to my own. I identified two main categories which engendered stress, one personal and the other linked to our professional contexts. Some of the areas described were those where the intrinsic nature of the difficulty 'touches our very core'— working with the sexually abused; with those who are suicidal; with those who have HIV or AIDS. In all these areas the counsellor's own emotional response can be engulfing and overwhelming. Whereas the absence of such a response might make us less than human, the stresses of managing and containing it can be harmful both to us and to our clients and if encountered too frequently can lead to burn-out. The stresses of those working within organisations and institutions share many characteristics with all occupational stress: they related to the discrepancy in ideology and expectations between practitioners, organisations and their users. This was demonstrated by Eddy Street who works with couples and families, where he stated 'Counsellors can find themselves in open dispute with the agency about roles and priorities'. Similar difficulties occur for those working within a GP's practice where '. . . counsellors can become the bearers of the unconscious system that is intended to shield us from unhappiness, rejection and abandonment'. This mismatch in counsellor/client perception is also described by Stephen Palmer in the ambivalently titled 'Stresses of Running a Stress Management Centre' where he also identified the stress related to his holding of multiple roles. Peter Roos, the director of a university counselling centre and John McLeod, a counsellor trainer, as well as many trainees themselves encountered pressurising role conflict. As a counsellor trainer I endorse McLeod's view that assessing trainees for personal awareness and growth, qualities which are well nigh indefinable, is brimming with difficulty. The dilemmas are accentuated when there is a question of failing a student, the most persistent cause of trainer stress. The clash between our nurturing, supportive role and the judgmental nature of ensuring that students meet criteria is often irreconcilable, causing high levels of trainer anxiety and self-doubt. In addition, a trainer's sense of contributing to student distress by accentuating the importance of being in touch

with their emotions can cause guilt and a sense of unjustifiable voyeurism.

Although Colin Feltham ascribed some of the stress of working at home directly to the environment, I liked the humane and honest way he acknowledged financial problems, as well as his discomfort at being 'a vendor of friendship'. His assurance that the occasional contravention of boundaries incurred by the sounds of children's voices or cooking smells was sometimes openly appreciated by clients, as well as being used in the client/counsellor dynamic, dispelled some of the pomposity which is often associated with the maintenance of such boundaries.

One of the strengths of this book is that each practitioner includes suggestions for improved coping, and just as we can learn from our shared difficulties, so we can also benefit from their experience of what works.

Val Simanowitz.

Raising a Son: Parents and the Making of a Healthy Man

Don and Jeanne Elium
Hawthorn Press Extent, 1995, £10.95, 256pp.

This practical parenting book offers many useful insights into raising a son. However, in exploring the developmental needs of boys, as opposed to girls or children in general, the Eliums open up discussions, helpful maps and pathways to becoming healthy men. They identify four forces that shape child development — social, biological, psychological and spiritual. These need nurturing and balancing to ensure all-round growth. But 'boys will be boys' — an influential biological force is testosterone, 'a drug-like hormone that is one of the most powerful manipulators of behaviour the world has ever known'. This hormone shapes male physique, but also affects behaviour — hence the tendency towards aggression, dominance and impulsive risk-taking, and the need for short-term cycles of tension and release. For example, boys often have the need for play-fights and sharp bouts of physical exercise to get things out of the system — energy later harnessed in sports.

The boy's journey over the bridge from 'mother's world' to 'father's world' is a key stage in his development, and sons find it hard to make this passage on their own. A boy needs close bonds with his mother so as to learn about his father and to explore the meaning of being a man.

In a society where tomboys are often encouraged, but young adolescent boys who play with dolls are put down as sissies, the Eliums' approach is helpful. Another strength of their book is its analysis of the different stages of male development in relationship to the appropriate parenting for that age. They also

warn about excessive pressure on boys to become men too early, which erodes their tender, creative side and the healthy life of feelings.

The authors write from their experience both as parents and as facilitators. Don Elium is a counsellor and Jeanne works with parenting support groups and with ritual groups for men and women. They have also written *Raising a Daughter*.

The thesis that boys and girls have differences despite gender-neutral parenting is challenging to feminist orthodoxy. Whereas good parenting helps boys with relationships and feelings, poor parenting has obscured the respect for the differences between boys and girls. This is where *Raising a Son* provokes a debate that I hope leads to a greater understanding of children and hence better parenting. This is, as Robert Bly writes on the cover, 'a thoughtful and powerful book'.

Martin Large

Demystifying Therapy

Ernesto Spinelli
Constable, 1994, 397pp.

Ernesto Spinelli is Principal Lecturer at the School of Psychotherapy and Counselling, Regent's College, London. It is not immediately obvious from its index, but this book advocates the existential-phenomenological model which is taught there. Part of the book's purpose is to show how this is a superior model to those Spinelli is demystifying, the psychoanalytical, cognitive-behavioural and humanistic. He made me aware of the ideological differences between these mainstream models, due to the variations in the underlying philosophical approaches. Interestingly the psychodynamic model is not mentioned (too hybrid I suppose) and couple counselling is discussed as befriending. Nevertheless I found it a fascinating book, full of challenging and stimulating ideas. Spinelli is a philosopher and writes logically and cleverly. It is not a book for bedside reading.

Self & Society gets a mention. To Spinelli the very name is an example of the split between the individual and society which is one of his criticisms of humanistic therapy.

He challenges the humanistic stance of unconditionality and says that the assumptions underlying the model (such as that change is desirable) impose conditions. He also observes that there are more 'gurus' amongst humanistic therapists, owing to the emphasis on self. Transpersonal therapy is considered to avoid that pitfall, with its view of a higher self.

A sub-text is the theme of power in therapy; Spinelli feels this is particularly open to abuse in the psychoanalytic model, for example in the therapist's unwillingness to self-disclose. He compares

the cognitive-behavioural model with the psychoanalytic model as 'instructional' rather than 'transferential', but feels there is a similar assumption of more power in the expertise of the therapist. He finds the scientific model limited, in that it avoids qualitative aspects of the therapeutic relationship such as emotions. He also asks who decides what beliefs are irrational, and suggests that cognitive and behavioural therapists put pressure on people to conform socially and culturally.

Basically, Spinelli thinks therapists are in philosophical terms too naive and do not examine their models critically enough. Instead they often focus mainly on techniques, and influence their clients in ways of which they are unaware. He believes that being with the client, a relational model, is philosophically the most moral, the safest and in fact the only justification for therapy. The mystery becomes, not the therapy, but the beingness of the people in the therapeutic relationship.

Despite the critical comparisons Spinelli makes, I think he implies that self-awareness, humility and a critical approach are fundamental to working in any therapeutic model. He does highlight aspects of each model which he regards as laudable. After reading this book open-mindedly most readers would, I believe, shift their ideas with regard to their own orientations. Perhaps some work on philosophy should be part of all therapy trainings, so that self-awareness and self-monitoring could be achieved at a greater depth of understanding.

Courtenay Young

The Making of Anti-Sexist Men

Harry Christian
Routledge, 1994, £12.99, 208pp.

This is an attempt to add some factual detail to the rather vague picture of anti-sexist men that is prevalent. It presents the result of a research project involving thirty men, each of whom was interviewed in depth. Some of the main points are summarised in the beginning. We then get the main part of the book where eight men are picked out. Each of them is given a chapter to himself, with a minimum of editorialising. There is a summing up, which says that there is a strong tendency for two things to be involved in the making of an anti-sexist man: early life experiences which departed from conventional gender expectations, and adult experience of feminist influence, usually in a close relationship with an active feminist. The main theoretical influences are Harry Brod and Bob Connell. There is a brief critique of Robert Bly.

This is a useful book, rather than a very exciting one. I felt it was pretty narrow, but accurate and well done within its limits.

John Rowan

Unreasonable Men

Victor J. Seidler
Routledge, 1994, 254pp.

Looked at from the point of view of humanistic psychology, this is an extraordinarily frustrating book. It is supposed to be about the identification of masculinity with reason, as opposed to emotion. One would think that this would entail a discussion of male responses to feminism, as it is feminism which raised this issue in the first place. And indeed there are chapters entitled 'Feminism' and 'Masculinity'.

The disappointment comes from the fact that hardly any of the current discussions of feminism and masculinity are mentioned. The standard text of Kenneth Clatterbaugh is not to be found, the work of Bob Connell is only mentioned in a footnote. Robert Bly also. Andrew Samuels too is only found in a footnote, and even that his name is wrongly spelt.

The whole topic of spirituality is ignored (Mary Daly is relegated to a footnote) and the mythopoetic approach to reason and men is studiously avoided. Psychotherapy is touched on briefly, but whereas Freud and psychoanalysis are mentioned many times, humanistic approaches are not to be found. Stanley Keleman exists in a footnote, but his name is also spelt wrong. The word 'gender' is not in the index.

This is really quite a limited book. The author is able to make statements like 'There has still been relatively little feminist discussion of relationships with men and of the ways women feel and experience their relationships with men.' This ignores the work, for example, of the journal *Feminism and Psychology* which for the whole of the 90s has been publishing papers in this area, and devoted a whole issue (later published as a book) to the topic of heterosexuality. It ignores the older work of Jessie Bernard, Jean Baker Miller, Hester Eisenstein, Jane Lazarre, Rebecca and Russell Dobash, Rosalind Coward — not to mention Simone de Beauvoir.

John Rowan

The Self in Social Inquiry

David N. Berg and Kenwyn K. Smith (eds)
Sage, 1988, £16.50, 400pp.

This is one of the new breed of books on research, fully cognisant of the new paradigm and all its implications. Their approach involves, they say: 1. Direct involvement with and/or observation of human beings or social systems;

2. commitment to a process of self-scrutiny by the researcher while he or she is conducting the research; 3. willingness to change theory or method in response to the research experience during the research itself; 4. description of social systems that is dense or thick and favours depth over breadth in any single undertaking; and 5. participation in the social system being studied, under the assumption that much of the information of interest is only accessible to or reportable by its members.

This tells us how to do research with people rather than on people.

The book was first published in 1985 with the title *Exploring Clinical Methods for Social Research*, but this title aroused so much misunderstanding that the editors and the publisher decided to change it to the much more suitable one now given. It gives us a set of 18 papers on research, some by well-known people such as Alderfer and Reinharz, others by authors who are lesser-known but equally good people; six of them are women.

It is in four sections: clinical issues, including the use of the self in research; clinical understanding, including an examination of the feminist approach; clinical involvement, including some good remarks on organisational research; and clinical methods, including participant observation. These between them cover hermeneutics, epistemology, feminism, anxiety, subjectivity, causality and many other problems.

The book is of a high standard throughout, has an integrated set of references, but no index — a brutal omission.

John Rowan

Multiple Mind: Healing the Split in Psyche and World

Gretchen Sliker
Shambhala, 1992, £9.99, 261pp.

This is an interesting book on subpersonalities by someone with roots in both Jungian analysis and psychosynthesis. The heart of the book is a set of three case histories, in each of which the concept of subpersonalities helped a great deal to produce a positive outcome.

Sliker is very clear about the differences between subpersonalities, the real self and the higher self, and uses the work of Ken Wilber to help in this. She calls the real self by the title Centre, and has an interesting account of five stages in the discovery of this:

'In the first stage, Centre may be completely unrecognized . . . The next stage . . . is, then, its recognition . . . The third step is the return of the war of the subpersonalities . . . the understanding and skills of Centre are as yet weak . . . In the next stage . . . a commitment to the practice of Centre returns . . . like relearning a forgotten skill, the practice is undertaken in many forms . . . The fifth and last step is

the actual development of the skills of Centre.' (pp.79-80)

This is the best account I have yet seen of this development, and it is well done. However someone seems to have got at the author and said 'What about society?' and this leads to what I feel is a weak part of the book, where Sliker tries to make out a case for saying that the United Nations is the Centre, in relation to the nations as subpersonalities. She illustrates this with a long discussion of the crisis over the airliner which was shot down over Korea in 1983.

But in the area of psychotherapy she is much stronger, and I liked her careful discussions of the differences between Jung and Assagioli, which I think put Assagioli much more in the very strong position which is his rightful due.

John Rowan

Jung on the East

J. J. Clarke (ed)
Routledge, 1995, £8.99, 248pp.

Jung and Eastern Thought

J. J. Clarke
Routledge, 1994, £12.99, 217pp.

The first of these books is a set of readings from the works of Jung, with an introduction by Clarke; the second is by Clarke himself, pulling together all the relevant strands and commenting on them.

It seems clear that Jung had an ambivalent attitude to Eastern philosophy, mixed as it is with psychology. He appreciated the psychology, and regarded much of the spiritual work of the East as more about psychology than about spirituality. But when he came to the religious philosophy, he was very suspicious, unwilling to tread the paths of mysticism, and always preferring Christianity in the end — though of course he had his reservations about that, too.

This is at first quite surprising. People who don't like Jung very often criticise him for being 'mystical', and to hear that he set his face against mysticism seems strange in this context. But it is clear from these books that Jung could not really accept anything which he had not experienced in himself and for himself. Everything had to be set against that template for testing. And in his own work on himself he had his limits. He was happy to explore the limits of his self, but it was always a psychological self. He would go so far as to agree that there were collective elements within that, particularly at an unconscious level, but would never give it up or really question it. To go further was for him to be metaphysical, and this

was a step he steadfastly refused to take.

He maintained that his psychology was a purely empirical inquiry, based solely on the deliverances of human experience, and therefore it 'treats all metaphysical claims and assertions as mental phenomena, and regards them as statements about the mind and its structure.' (1995, p.18)

Nevertheless, this book contains readings of Jung taken from a large number of his books and papers, and gives an unrivalled conspectus of what Jung actually said.

In the second book, Clarke surveys the whole scene with great comprehension, mentioning writers such as Samuels, Assagioli and Wilber, and in the end has to admit that: 'Perhaps Jung was not the great champion of spiritual values, the prophet of spiritual renewal that he is sometimes made out to be. Perhaps he was in fact a reductionist, despite his own frequent claims to the contrary. It is true that he rejected what he saw as Freud's attempt to reduce the psychic world to the level of sexual desire . . . But at the same time Jung himself could be accused of failing to grasp the full significance of the philosophical systems of the East. Statements like "the world of gods and spirits is truly 'nothing but' the collective unconscious inside me" (CW 11.857) would seem to support this claim.' (Clarke 1994, p.175)

In the end perhaps what we have to say is that Jung was indeed fascinated by the East and its doctrines, but that he never surrendered to it. He can teach us much of value about the psychological connections of East and West, but when he comes to spirituality he lets us down.

It has to be said that these are very good books, and absolutely necessary to anyone who wants to study these matters.

John Rowan